The fall of PBES in California

Lessons from the SB 277 campaign
• Review of the legislative effort
  ◦ Timeline
  ◦ Support and Opposition
  ◦ The Legislative Process

• Lessons learned
CAMPAIGN TIMELINE
• AB 2109 (Pan) – 2012 - Required a parent or guardian seeking an exemption to show evidence that they had received information from a health care practitioner about the benefits and risks of the immunization, as well as the risks of the diseases a child could contract.
Legislation Announced

February 4, 2015
Will eliminate the personal beliefs exemption option from school immunization law and also require the governing board of a school district to notify parents or guardians of a school’s immunization rates.
Committee Hearings
Average of 5 hours each
**APRIL**
- 9: Senate Health - 6-2
- 15: Senate Education- Testimony Only
- 22: Senate Education – 7-2
- 28: Senate Judiciary – 5-1

**May**
- 14: Senate Floor – 25-11

**June**
- 10: Assembly Health – 12-6
- 25: Assembly Floor – 46-31
- 29: Senate Floor – concurrence – 24-14

**Votes**
June 30th – Governor Signs Bill
Partners

California Medical Association – Sponsor
Vaccinate California - Sponsor
Grassroots Support
Lorena Gonzalez
@LorenaSGonzalez

Proud to stand w/ sb277 authors @DrPanMD & @BenAllenCA & @MrTonyMendoza after the Assembly passed this important bill

California Newspapers Agree on Vaccine Bill:
Los Angeles Times  THE SACRAMENTO BEE
The Fresno Bee  San Jose Mercury News

Los Angeles Daily News
Pass SB 277

Media Support
OPPOSITION
KILL SB277

4 GIMES CREATED WITH ABORTED FETAL CELLS

FORCED VACCINATION VIOLATES my freedom of religion

MY GRANDCHILD HAD A VACCINE REACTION

Teachers for Informed Consent NO SB277
The Unanswered Questions of Senate Bill 277

The following are a series of issues and questions that have yet to be addressed by Senators Pan and Allen regarding Senate Bill 277. We the people respectfully request that our legislators ask these questions on our behalf so that the public and legislature can better understand the full reach and impact of SB 277.

Questions Relating To Education

1. How will the state be able to protect the rights of students with disabilities when the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA; federal law) states (i) Special classes, separate schooling, or other removal of children with disabilities from the regular educational environment occurs only if the nature or severity of the disability is such that education in regular classes with the use of supplementary aids and services cannot be achieved satisfactorily (34 CFR §§ 300.114–300.118, inclusive).

2. How will school districts provide speech therapy, occupational therapy, physical therapy, behavioral therapy, and other “related services” identified in the Individualized Education Program (IEP) of children with special needs who will be forced into home-based private schools? Will school districts, equipped to provide these services extensively in the home, be able to bear the financial burden of implementing SB 277 while complying with the provisions of IDEA?

3. How does this bill meet the California constitutional mandate to provide a Free and Appropriate Public Education (FAPE)?

4. How are single-parent families, who are sustained completely by one income, going to be able to homeschool their children?

5. What considerations will be made for families who can’t afford to homeschool to avoid the inherent discriminatory impacts of the bill?

6. How will SB 277 address the needs of English learners, particularly in families whose parents speak English as their second language, considering state law requires all instruction (including homeschool instruction) be in English?

7. Where in the bill is the “grandfathering” language that will allow existing personal belief exemptions (PBE) to remain valid until the next statutory “checkpoint” or new enrollment that Senator Allen mentioned in the Senate Judiciary Committee hearing on April 28th, 2015?

8. Some schools and/or school districts with higher PBE rates will be more heavily impacted by a loss in ADA than others. How will they be assisted?
Vaccine Conspiracy Event-
Scientology Community Center in Los Angeles with Nation of Islam and Robert F. Kennedy, Jr.

WARNING

We have received information that possibly another Tuskegee experiment will be taking place! Come and hear the facts about this startling information coming from the Senior Lead Scientist who works for the Center for Disease Control! The fact that there is something in the vaccine shots that gives black boys autism at a rate 3 to 5 times greater than their white counterparts.

Come and hear from
ROBERT F. KENNEDY JR.
DR. BRIAN HOOKER
Biochemical Scientist
and Minister
TONY MUHAMMAD!

THIS THURSDAY, JUNE 18TH
8039 S. Vermont Ave, LA CA, 90044
at 7:00pm. Doors open at 6:30pm

OUR PEOPLE ARE UNDER ATTACK!
Ads from “A Voice for Choice, Inc”
Arguments of Opposition

- Constitutionality – Legality of mandatory vaccination
- Right to education issues
- Volume of confusing information
- Vaccine safety
- Downplaying /denial of disease risk
• Exclude children who are home schooled and independent study off school campus from vaccination requirements

• Require PBEs for those vaccines added through administrative action

• Restatement of fact that state law does not trump federal special education law

• Medical Exemption – inclusion of “family medical history” language
SB 277:

- No longer permits immunization exemptions based on personal beliefs for children in child care and public and private schools

- Permits personal belief exemptions submitted before January 1, 2016 to remain valid until a pupil reaches kindergarten or 7th grade;

- Immunization not required for:
  - Students in home-based private schools
  - Students enrolled in an independent study program who do not receive classroom-based instruction
  - Access to special education and related services specified in an individualized education program
• Students in the above categories still need to provide immunization records to their schools before entry, and schools will still need to report immunizations to CDPH.

• Allows medical and personal beliefs exemptions from any new immunization requirement initiated by CDPH for attendance at school or child care.
• Worked in public health policy for almost a decade

• BUT first foray into vaccine policy was AB 2109 implementation

• Mother of a daughter born in 2010
Figure 1. Epidemic curve of reported pertussis cases and deaths by month of onset – California, 2005, 2009-2010*

*As of 8/3/2010; data are incomplete due to reporting delays
2014-15 Kinder Vaccination Rates

- DTP - 76%
- Polio - 82%
- MMR - 74%
- HepB - 87%
- VAR - 90%
LESSONS LEARNED
1. Messengers Matter
“In medical school, we studied photos of measles. The professors told us we’d likely never see the disease in person, but I did,” said Pan, who will turn 50 this fall. “It was awful.”

- Dr. Richard Pan

1. Messengers Matter

2. Timing, Timing, Timing

3. Prepare champions for the vitriol
4. Stay above the fray and on message

5. Don’t forget education laws

6. TRUST
Alecia Sanchez
California Medical Association
916.444.5532
asanchez@cmanet.org
Rapid Response Public Health Advocacy: Indiana’s HPV Letter

Beth Meyerson, MDiv., PhD
Assistant Professor of Health Management & Policy Co-Director, Rural Center for AIDS/STD Prevention
• The letter
• The response
• The response to the response
• Take homz
• Increases pediatric and adolescent vaccination completion (private practices, school health clinics)

• Cost effective

Indiana HPV Reminder/Recall Letters & HPV vaccination completion (>2)

Sept: reminder letters sent to non-initiating HPV vax households
Recent Indiana HPV Policy & Vax Completion Time Line

- **2nd & 3rd HPV dose reminder letter**
- **3rd HPV dose reminder letter**
- **Feb: Failed to set 80% HPV vax goal (HB 1359)**
- **Sept: reminder letters begin to non-initiating HPV vax households**
- **October 23-November 6 Advocacy Activity**
Advocacy Coalition Activity
October 26 - November 6, 2015

Email campaign & media advocacy from American Family Association of Indiana

Governor: “Will look into it”

Center for HPV Research letter to Gov Pence

Health organization’s send letter to Gov Pence

State changes HPV letter language

Media advocacy from HPV vax supporters (research, health, political)

October 23
October 29
Nov 2
Nov 6
• Rapid, coordinated response to re-engage the advocacy coalition

• Broad – researchers & human service agencies

• Social media initiated, press picked up
Engaged the Network: Relationships were already in place, and communications started immediately.

Leaders stepped forward to engage their partners and organizations.

Organizations quickly drafted letters and vetted through their organizations.

Posted copy of letter(s) on Social Media.
### Human Service Orgs
- IN Imms Coalition
- IN Family Health Council
- Minority Health Coalitions
- Little Red Door
- Kristen Forbes EVE Foundation
- American Cancer Society Cancer Action Network
- Community Wellness Partners

### Research Orgs
- Center for HPV Research (IU, Purdue, Notre Dame)
- IU Simon Cancer Center
- IU School of Medicine
- IU Kelley School of Business
- Purdue College of Pharmacy
- IU Schools of Public Health
- Rural Center for AIDS/STD Prevention

**Just how broad was it?**
Governor Pence Chooses Ideology over Recommendation from Medical Professionals on HPV Letter

INDIANAPOLIS – Drew Lindeman, communications director for the Indiana Democratic Party, released a statement critical of Governor Mike Pence following his announcement that he would be withdrawal from a letter encouraging Hoosiers to get the HPV vaccine.

"Governor Mike Pence’s ideology has got the best of him again, but this time, our Hoosier children’s overall well-being, not just his political agenda, is at stake," said Drew Lindeman, communications director for the Indiana Democratic Party.

"The HPV vaccine is a vital tool in the fight against cervical cancer, and we cannot afford to have the Governor’s political agenda stand in the way of protecting our children’s health. It is clear that Governor Pence is putting ideology over the health and well-being of our children," said Lindeman.

The Indiana Democratic Party released the following statement in response to Governor Pence’s actions:

"Governor Mike Pence has chosen to override the recommendations of medical professionals and instead issued a letter encouraging Hoosiers to get the HPV vaccine. This is a significant step forward in our efforts to combat cervical cancer and protect the health of our children. We are grateful to Governor Pence for his leadership on this issue and look forward to working with him and others to ensure that all Hoosiers have access to the HPV vaccine.

In addition to Governor Pence’s letter, the Indiana Democratic Party has been an ardent advocate for the HPV vaccine and its importance in preventing cervical cancer. We have worked tirelessly to increase awareness about the vaccine and its benefits, and we will continue to do so.

We encourage Hoosiers to take advantage of this important opportunity to protect their health and the health of their children. The HPV vaccine is a safe and effective way to prevent cervical cancer, and we are proud to support Governor Pence in his efforts to make this vaccine accessible to all Hoosiers.

To learn more about the HPV vaccine and how to get it in Indiana, please visit the Indiana Department of Health’s website at [Indiana Department of Health](https://www.in.gov/health/).
New Letter, New Messages

• Inform about HPV, cancer, and vaccines to prevent it
• HPV causes cancers in men and women; very common STD
• Vax is best prevention
• Vax is safe and highly effective
• Continue HPV screening

• ISDH routinely reminds about vax completion
• Your child has not started HPV vax
• You can opt out of registry; how.
• HPV most common STD, but will likely go away
• Sometimes causes cancer
• Vax is recommended
Was this a win or a lose?

Both

- Increased public awareness about HPV vaccine because of controversy (win)
- Letter language improved and degraded (meh)
- Strengthened advocacy coalition (win)
- Ideology trumped public health (again)….lose
• Anyone can “do” advocacy

• Advocacy is as much about educating our communities as it is about educating policy makers

• Timing is everything

• Relationships help… A LOT

• We won’t always win, but we build capacity for the ‘next round’
Voices for Vaccines

Helping everyday parents advocate for high immunization rates in every community
Voices for Vaccines’ platforms for parent stories

Why I Choose

Growing Up Unvaccinated

I am the 70s child of a health nut. I wasn’t vaccinated, I was brought up on an incredibly healthy diet: no sugar till I was one, breastfed for over a year, organic homegrown vegetables, raw milk, no MSG, no additives, no aspartame. My mother used homeopathy, aromatherapy, osteopathy, we took daily supplements of vitamin C, echinacea, cod liver oil. I had an outdoor lifestyle; I grew up next to a farm, walked everywhere, did sports and danced twice a week, drank plenty of water. I wasn’t even allowed pop; even my fresh juice was watered down to protect my teeth, and I would’ve killed for white, shop-bought bread in my lunch box once in a while and biscuits instead of fruit like all the other kids. We only ate (organic local) meat maybe once or twice a week and my mother and father cooked everything from scratch – I have yet to taste a Findus crispy pancake and oven chips were reserved for those nights when mum and dad had friends over and we got a “treat!”
Voices for Vaccines’ tools for advocacy

www.VoicesForVaccines.org/TOOLS
Connect with Voices for Vaccines

- [www.VoicesForVaccines.org/join-us](http://www.VoicesForVaccines.org/join-us)
- Karen Ernst: [info@voicesforvaccines.org](mailto:info@voicesforvaccines.org)
- Find us on social media:
  - Facebook
  - Pinterest
  - Twitter (@voices4vaccines)
  - Instagram (voices4vaccines)